REVIEW ARTICLE

Microbial contamination of fruit and vegetables and the behaviour of enteropathogens in the phyllosphere: a review

J.C. Heaton and K. Jones

Department of Biological Sciences, Lancaster Environment Centre, Lancaster University, Lancaster, UK

Keywords

contamination, enteropathogens, irrigation water, phyllosphere, salad vegetables.

Correspondence

J. Heaton, Biological Sciences, Lancaster Environment Centre, Lancaster University, Lancaster, LA1 4YQ, UK. E-mail: j.heaton2@lancaster.ac.uk

2007/0201: received 9 February 2007, revised 23 August 2007 and accepted 23 August 2007

doi:10.1111/j.1365-2672.2007.03587.x

Summary

Consumption of fruit and vegetable products is commonly viewed as a potential risk factor for infection with enteropathogens such as Salmonella and Escherichia coli O157, with recent outbreaks linked to lettuce, spinach and tomatoes. Routes of contamination are varied and include application of organic wastes to agricultural land as fertilizer, contamination of waters used for irrigation with faecal material, direct contamination by livestock, wild animals and birds and postharvest issues such as worker hygiene. The ability of pathogens to survive in the field environment has been well studied, leading to the implementation of guidelines such as the Safe Sludge Matrix, which aim to limit the likelihood of viable pathogens remaining at point-of-sale. The behaviour of enteropathogens in the phyllosphere is a growing field of research, and it is suggested that inclusion in phyllosphere biofilms or internalization within the plant augments the survival. Improved knowledge of plant-microbe interactions and the interaction between epiphytic and immigrant micro-organisms on the leaf surface will lead to novel methods to limit enteropathogen survival in the phyllosphere.

Introduction

It is now commonly accepted that fruit and vegetable consumption is a risk factor for infection with enteric pathogens. Recent examples of outbreaks related to fresh produce include cases of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 (spinach, lettuce), *Salmonella* Typhimurium and *S.* Newport (tomatoes, lettuce), *S.* Thompson (rocket) and hepatitis A (spring onion). Table 1 gives a comprehensive list of recent outbreaks.

Increased consumption of fresh fruit and vegetables

Consumption of fresh produce has increased (Anon, 2007) mainly because of heightened awareness of the benefits of a healthy diet and the impact of the 'Five a Day' and 'Nine a Day' governmental campaigns in the UK and USA. This has led to consumer demand for improved choice, such as minimally processed, prepacked, ready-toeat fruit and vegetables (Everis 2004) and availability of out-of-season produce.

Prepared produce, such as bagged salads, may provide the conditions for the proliferation and survival of human pathogens. Cut surfaces exude nutrients, which can be utilized for growth and the pathogens *E. coli* O157:H7 and *Listeria monocytogenes* have been shown to attach to the cut surfaces of lettuce leaves and penetrate the internal tissue, indicating protection from chemical sanitizers (Takeuchi and Frank 2000). However, surveys of bagged salads often recover low numbers of enteropathogens (Szabo *et al.* 2000; Francis *et al.* 1999; Lin *et al.* 1996). Adak *et al.* (2005) calculated the disease risks of food groups and reported a low risk ratio for salad vegetables, although fresh produce was reported to have a considerable, if occasional, impact on disease incidence in a population.

Another factor that impacts directly on microbial quality is the increase in importation to meet consumer

Table 1	Reported	fresh-produce	related	outbreaks	of	Salmonella,	Escherichia	coli	and	Campylobacter,	1996	onwards	and	viral	gastroenteritis,
1990 o	nwards														

Year	Pathogen	Vehicle	Reference
1997	Salmonella Enteritidis	Cauliflower	Anon (2005a)
1997	S. Enteritidis PT4	Pepper	Anon (2005a)
1997	S. Meleagridis	Sprouted seeds (alfalfa)	Taormina <i>et al.</i> (1999)
1997	S. Infantis/S. Anatum	Sprouted seeds (alfalfa and mung bean)	Taormina <i>et al.</i> (1999)
1997	S. Saphra	Cantaloupe	Sivaplasingham et al. (2004)
1997–8	S. Senftenberg	Sprouted seeds (clover and alfalfa)	Taormina et al. (1999)
1998	S. Havana/S. Cubana/S. Tennessee	Sprouted seeds (alfalfa)	Taormina <i>et al.</i> (1999)
1998	S. Oranienburg	Cantaloupe	Anon (2001a,b)
1998–99	S. Baildon	Tomatoes	Anon (2001a,b)
1999	S. Muenchen	Unpasteurized orange juice	Anon (2001a,b)
1999	S. Thompson	Cilantro	Sivaplasingham et al. (2004)
1999	S. paratyphi B var. java	Sprouted seed products	Stratton et al. (2001)
2000	S. Enteritidis	Unpasteurized citrus juice	Anon (2001a,b)
2000	S. Poona	Cantaloupe	CDC (2002a)
2000	S. Typhimurium	Lettuce	Horby <i>et al.</i> (2003)
2000	S. Typhimurium DT104	Lettuce	Anon (2005a)
2000	S. Typhimurium DT204B	Lettuce	Anon (2005a)
2000	S. Enteritidis 11b	Mung bean sprouts	Harb <i>et al.</i> (2003)
2001	S. Kottbus	Sprouted seeds (alfalfa)	CDC (2002b)
2001	S. Newport	Mixed bagged salad	Anon (2005a)
2001	S. Virchow	Salad items	Anon (2005a)
2001	S. Poona	Cantaloupe	CDC (2002a)
2001	S. Enteritidis	Mung bean sprouts	Honish and Nguyen (2001)
2002	S. Javiana	Tomatoes	CDC (2002c)
2002	S. Poona	Cantaloupe	CDC (2002a)
2003–4	S. Enteritidis	Almonds	CDC (2004)
2004	S. Newport	Lettuce	Gillespie (2004)
2004	S. Thompson	Rocket salad	Nygard <i>et al.</i> (2004)
2004	S. Braenderup	Tomatoes	CDC (2005)
2004	S. Javiana	Tomatoes	Anon (2005a)
2005	S. Typhimurium DT104	Spanish lettuce	Takkinen <i>et al.</i> 2005
2005	S. Typhimurium DT104	Lettuce	Anon (2005a)
2005	S. Enteritidis	Bean sprouts	Anon (2005b)
2006	S. Newport	Tomatoes	Anon (2007)
2006	S. Typhimurium	Tomatoes	CDC (2006a)
2007	S. Senftenberg	Basil	Pezzoli <i>et al.</i> (2007)
1997	E. coli O157:H7	Sprouted seeds (alfalfa)	Sivaplasingham <i>et al.</i> 2004
1997	E coli Q157:H7	Salad	Anon (2005a)
1998	E coli O157·H7	Salad	Anon (2001a b)
1998	E. coli 0157:H7	Fruit salad	Anon (2001a.b)
1998	E coli Q157:H7	Coleslaw	Anon (2001a b)
1998	E coli Q157:H7	Sprouted seeds (clover/alfalfa)	Taormina <i>et al</i> 1999
1998	E. coli 0157:H7	Unpasteurized apple juice	Anon (2001a.b)
1998	E. coli 0157:H7	Parslev	Sivaplasingham <i>et al.</i> 2004
1999	E coli Q157:H7	Coriander (cilantro)	Campbell <i>et al</i> 2001
1999	E coli Q157:H7	Unpasteurized apple juice	Anon (2001a b)
2003	$E_{\rm coli} O 157:H7$	Cucumber	Duffell et al. (2003)
2003	E coli 0157:H7		Anon (2005a)
2005	E. coli Q157:H7	Lettuce	Söderström <i>et al.</i> (2005)
2006	E coli Q157:H7	Spinach	CDC (2006b)
2006	E coli 0157:H7		CDC (2006c)
1996	Campylobacter ieiuni	Salad items	Mandrell and Brandl (2004)
1996			CDC (1998)
1996	C. jejuni	Lettuce	Anon (2005a)
1997	C. ieiuni	Sweet potatoest	Harriman 1998

Table 1 Continued

Year	Pathogen	Vehicle	Reference
1997	C. jejuni	Cucumber‡	Kirk <i>et al.</i> 1997
2000	C. jejuni	Lettuce	Anon (2005a)
2001	C. jejuni	Orange juice	Anon (2005a)
1990	Norovirus	Fresh cut fruit	Herwaldt <i>et al.</i> (1994)
1990	Hepatitis A	Iceberg lettuce	Seymour and Appleton (2001)
1992	Norovirus	Lettuce/tomato	Anon (2005a)
1992	Norovirus	Melon	Anon (2005a)
1992	Hepatitis A	Strawberries	Seymour and Appleton (2001)
1994	Hepatitis A	Tomatoes§	Anon (2001a)
1994	Norovirus	Salad	Anon (2005a)
1994	Norovirus	Carrot	Anon (2005a)
1994	Norovirus	Salad	Anon (2005a)
1995	Norovirus	Salad	Anon (2005a)
1995	Norovirus	Salad	Anon (2005a)
1995	Hepatitis A	Diced tomatoes	Seymour and Appleton (2001)
1997	Hepatitis A	Frozen strawberries§	Anon (2001a)
1997	Unknown virus	Orange juice	Anon (2005a)
1998	Norovirus	Fruit salad	Anon (2005a)
1998	Norovirus	Fruit salad	Anon (2005a)
1998	Hepatitis A	Salad items	Seymour and Appleton (2001)
1999	Norovirus	Salad items	Anon (2005a)
1999	Norovirus	Salad items	Anon (2005a)
2001	Norovirus	Raspberries	Le Guyader et al. (2004)
2002	Norovirus	Salad items	Anon (2005a)
2002	Norovirus	Fruit salad	Anon (2005a)
2004	Hepatitis A	Spring onion§	Josefson (2003)
2005	Norovirus	Raspberries	Korsager et al. (2005)
2005	Norovirus	Raspberries	Cotterelle et al. (2005)
2006	Norovirus	Raspberries	Hjertqvist <i>et al.</i> (2006)

*Cross-contamination from chicken juices.

†Cross-contamination either with meat juices or kale garnish.

‡Contamination during storage or processing.

§Thought to be due to contact with an infected food handler.

expectations for a wide choice of exotic fruit and vegetables year-round. As standards of hygiene at harvest, during storage, and of irrigation water can vary widely in different countries, the potential for contamination of produce may be increased and consumers may be exposed to high numbers and/or different strains of pathogens. Imported produce from Mexico has been shown to be of an equivalent microbial quality to domestic samples in the USA (Johnston *et al.* 2006), but a number of outbreaks have been linked to imported produce, for example lettuce imported into the UK from Spain during 2005 (Takkinen *et al.* 2005).

The increase in outbreaks related to fresh produce can, in part, be attributed to changing consumer habits. A Food Standards Agency survey completed in the UK (Anon 2007) showed that 63% of people used large supermarkets for the majority of food shopping, whilst only 2% used specialist local stores. If contaminated items enter the large-scale production facilities relied upon by supermarkets, affected final products are likely to reach an increased number of consumers. Outbreaks are more likely to be identified than sporadic cases. Indeed, the number of sporadic cases linked to the consumption of contaminated fresh fruit and vegetables is unknown. Improved surveillance programmes have resulted in outbreaks being more readily identified, with fresh produce now increasingly likely to be considered a vehicle of infection and therefore included in any investigation.

During April 2007, two major recalls of bagged lettuce occurred in the UK after *Salmonella* contamination was detected. Product recalls, such as these, damage consumer confidence and are economically damaging for the industry, which makes the high investment in microbiological surveillance an economic necessity.

An improved understanding of the behaviour of enteropathogenic bacteria on salad vegetables should help

prevent both the initial contamination events and microbial persistence up to the point-of-sale (POS).

Significant pathogens

Bacteria

Salmonella

Salmonella spp. are the most commonly identified aetiological agent associated with fresh produce-related infection, isolated in 48% of cases between 1973 and 1997 in the USA (Sivaplasingham *et al.* 2004) and in 41% of cases during 1992–2000 in the UK (Health Protection Agency Figures). During 2006, two major tomato-related Salmonella outbreaks in the USA accounted for 23.2% of reported Salmonella cases (CDC 2007).

A range of fresh fruit and vegetable products have been implicated in *Salmonella* infection, most commonly lettuce, sprouted seeds, melon and tomatoes. *Salmonella* spp. are often isolated from produce sampled in routine surveys, including lettuce, cauliflower, sprouts, mustard cress, endive and spinach (Thunberg *et al.* 2002) and mushrooms (Doran *et al.* 2005).

Escherichia coli O157:H7

Escherichia coli O157:H7 can be isolated from the faeces of livestock; therefore, its presence in animal manures and slurries is inevitable (Kudva et al. 1998). In addition to farm animals, E coli O157:H7 may be present in the faeces of wild birds, for example, starlings (Moller Nielsen et al. 2004) and gulls (Wallace et al. 1997). Leafy vegetables are most commonly linked to E. coli infection, but apple juice (cider in the USA) is an interesting vehicle, as the acidity of the product is considered inhibitory to bacterial proliferation. Escherichia coli O157:H7 is commonly recovered from the faeces of ruminants; therefore, livestock grazing in orchards may contaminate fallen apples with faeces and, as E. coli O157:H7 can proliferate in damaged apple tissue (Stopforth et al. 2004), this can result in the contamination of unpasteurized fruit juices/ciders. Janisiewicz et al. (1999) demonstrated that fruit flies were an important vector in the contamination of apples with E. coli O157:H7, both preharvest and in packing houses.

Listeria monocytogenes

Listeria spp. are ubiquitous in the environment and can be isolated from soil, water, vegetation, the faeces of livestock and vegetation irrigated with contaminated water. The potential for environmental *Listeria* to contaminate fresh produce and lead to enteric infection has long been recognized (Blakeman 1985) and Harvey and Gilmour (1993)

suggested this most probably occurred during processing. The predominant *L. monocytogenes* serotype isolated from salad vegetables has been shown to be serogroup 1 (Harvey and Gilmour 1993; Heisick *et al.* 1989).

Beuchat (1998) reports a number of surveys documenting the presence of L. monocytogenes on cucumber, peppers, potato, radish, leafy vegetables, beansprout, broccoli, tomato and cabbage at POS. These surveys show variation in prevalence on different types of produce and between countries. Arumugaswamy et al. (1994) isolated L. monocytogenes from beansprout (85%), leafy vegetables (22%) and cucumber (80%) in Malaysia. In comparison, only 6.7% of cucumbers sampled in Pakistan yielded L. monocytogenes (Beuchat 1998). Two surveys of cabbage in Canada reported a prevalence of 2.2% (Schlech et al. 1983) and 6.7% (Odumeru et al. 1997) respectively, but a larger study in the US reported only 1.1% positive samples (Heisick et al. 1989). A US survey of potatoes reported a higher incidence (27.1%) than a survey conducted in Spain (16.7%) (Beuchat 1998) and two separate studies of radish in the US reported results of 14.4% and 36.8% prevalence. Generally, contamination is higher on root vegetables and Heisich et al. (1989) suggest that this is due to increased contact with soil. Variations in sample size, sampling regimes and laboratory protocols will also impact on the likelihood of isolation and therefore prevalence data.

Szabo *et al.* (2000) surveyed 120 bagged lettuce samples in Australia and reported isolation of *L. monocytogenes* in 2.5% samples. Thunberg *et al.* (2002) sampled a range of fresh produce and isolated *L. monocytogenes* only from potatoes (50%) and field cress (18%) purchased at farmers' markets. These varied results are likely to represent differences in production practices between countries, within countries and between outlets. This indicates the huge natural variability in the microbial quality of produce.

Crépet *et al.* (2007) analysed 165 studies and reported that prevalence on salad vegetables is usually under 5%, with lower numbers isolated from leafy salad vegetables than from sprouted seeds and other vegetables (e.g. carrots, cabbage, celery and spinach). This paper also showed that surveys conducted after 2000 reported lower instances of *L. monocytogenes* isolation, suggesting that increased knowledge of the behaviour of the pathogen in the food processing environment and more effective sanitization procedures have led to improved product control.

Listeria monocytogenes will grow at refrigeration temperatures (Wonderling *et al.* 2004) therefore is likely to multiply during storage if present on fresh produce. Beuchat and Brackett (1990) showed that *L. monocytogenes* is capable of growth on lettuce when exposed to processing conditions, although carrot juice seemed inhibitory. Farber *et al.* (1998) demonstrated that *L. monocytogenes* populations declined on grated carrot by 2-logs over 9 days.

Although *Listeria* contamination of fresh produce and survival up to POS seems likely, outbreaks linked to fresh produce are infrequent and tend to be limited to vulnerable groups. The two documented outbreaks which have occurred, in 1979 and 1981 respectively, were attributed to cabbage (in coleslaw) and salad items (celery, lettuce and tomatoes) served as part of hospital meals (Anon 2001a,b). The high infective dose of *L. monocytogenes*, ~10⁶ cells, variation in susceptibility in the population and long incubation period may also explain the scarcity of recorded fresh produce-related outbreaks (McLauchlin *et al.* 2004).

Campylobacter jejuni

Campylobacter jejuni is the most common cause of gastrointestinal illness worldwide, affecting over 2 million people in the USA and 50 000 throughout England and Wales annually (Evans *et al.* 2003) but cases are usually sporadic. Outbreaks are most commonly linked to poultry or cross-contamination from poultry products (Gillespie *et al.* 2003). As *Campylobacter* cannot grow outside of a warm-blooded host, survival on fresh produce is limited, especially if not protected from UV light (Obiri-Danso *et al.* 2001).

Epidemiological evidence suggests that salad vegetables are the second-highest risk factor for *Campylobacter* infection after poultry (Evans *et al.* 2003), and outbreaks have been linked to lettuce, sweet potatoes, cucumber, melon and strawberries (Brandl *et al.* 2004). Kumar *et al.* (2001) isolated *C. jejuni* from spinach, fenugreek, lettuce, radish, parsley, green onions, potatoes and mushrooms and Park and Sanders (1992) reported *Campylobacter* spp. on 1.6–3.3% vegetables tested, but other extensive studies of raw organic and prepack salad vegetables failed to isolate *Campylobacter* (Evans *et al.* 2003). It is suggested that outbreaks linked to fresh produce may be due to cross-contamination in the kitchen (Evans *et al.* 2003).

Aeromonas

Aeromonas spp. are ubiquitous in water, soil, faeces and on vegetation (McMahon and Wilson 2001). Aeromonas has been isolated from a wide range of fresh produce including sprouted seeds, asparagus, broccoli, cauliflower, carrot, celery, cherry tomatoes, courgette, cucumber, lettuce, mushroom, pepper, turnip and watercress (Merino *et al.* 1995). Watercress was found to yield higher numbers of Aeromonas than lettuce or escarole (chicory) samples (Saad *et al.* 1995). Thirty-four percent of organic vegetables were found to be contaminated with Aeromonas (McMahon and Wilson 2001) compared with 26% of conventionally cultivated vegetables (Neyts *et al.* 2001). Growth of *Aeromonas* will occur on shredded lettuce, chicory (Jacxens *et al.* 1999) and tomatoes (Velazquez *et al.* 1998) but not on carrots or Brussels sprouts (Jacxens *et al.* 1999). Callister and Aggar (1987) found that 48% *Aeromonas* isolates from fresh vegetables were *A. hydrophila*, the species most often linked to disease in humans.

Food isolates of *Aeromonas* have been shown to tolerate low pH and to grow at the refrigeration temperatures relied upon for preservation throughout the fresh produce supply chain (Merino *et al.* 1995).

It has been suggested that *Aeromonas* may be responsible for the many gastrointestinal infections (~40%) for which no aetiological agent is found (McMahon and Wilson 2001). However, results from volunteer studies are inconclusive and investigations of foodborne outbreaks fail to indisputably establish *Aeromonas* as the causative agent (Isonhood and Drake 2002). A link has been suggested between the increased incidence of *Aeromonas* in human stools and on fresh vegetable samples during the summer months (Saad *et al.* 1995). Neyts *et al.* (2001) suggest that *Aeromonas* may only pose a risk to immunocompromized groups.

Viral pathogens

Virus particles, such as those of norovirus and hepatitis A, are excreted by an infected host or released in vomit, therefore are likely to be present in sewage and faecally contaminated water. During the period 1992–99, viruses accounted for a similar number (c. 20%) of produce-related infections as *Salmonella* (Seymour and Appleton 2001). Enteric viruses have a low infective dose, and remain active even after exposure to low pH (<3) (Seymour and Appleton 2001) and temperature extremes. Freezing, for example, augments virus persistence (Le Guyader *et al.* 2004). Contaminated produce is therefore likely to remain infectious to POS, regardless of processing conditions, although Bidawid *et al.* (2001) suggest that exposure to plant metabolites such as phenolics may cause loss of activity.

Irrigation with sewage-contaminated water was linked to hepatitis A outbreaks associated with lettuce consumption (Seymour and Appleton 2001) and spring onions (Josefson 2003). Contact with an infected food handler can also contaminate food and as viruses can remain viable on inanimate objects and surfaces, it can be simple for poor hygiene practices to lead to food contamination. A number of outbreaks have been directly traced to infected food preparers or pickers (Seymour and Appleton 2001).

Routes of contamination

Organic fertilizers

Use of organic fertilizers, such as animal manures and slurries (Beuchat 1996; Natvig *et al.* 2002), abattoir wastes (Avery *et al.* 2005) and sewage sludge (Al-Ghazali and Al-Azawi 1990) introduce pathogens directly to the field, and run-off can contaminate irrigation water.

Over 90 million tonnes of animal waste are put to land annually in the UK (Food Standards Agency 2004a, Aviation House, London, UK). There are comprehensive guidelines available to growers that advise on sufficient treatment of wastes and correct timing of application, with the aim of limiting contamination of crops. In the UK, these guidelines are set out in the Safe Sludge Matrix (ADAS) (Anon 2001b) and the Codes of Good Agricultural Practice (Department of the Environment, Food and Rural Affairs). The Safe Sludge Matrix, for example, states that even when enhanced-treated sludge is applied to land, a 10-month harvest interval is necessary and the use of conventionally treated sludge requires a 30-month harvest interval for salad crops. These intervals should be sufficient to ensure the microbial quality of produce at harvest. Similar recommendations are set out in the United States Environment Protection Agency Part 503 Biosolids Rule (Anon 1993) and Canadian Ministry of the Environment guidelines (Anon 1996).

Irrigation water quality

Faecal material, soil and other inputs such as sewage overflow introduce enteropathogens directly to watercourses from which irrigation water may be extracted. In the UK, 71% of irrigation water is obtained from surface waters, which receive treated sewage effluent (Tyrell et al. 2006). The potential for contamination via irrigation water is increased in the developing world, as untreated wastewater is used for irrigation of around 10% of crops (Anon 2003). Wastewater irrigated crops show an increased incidence of enteropathogens (Steele and Odemeru 2004). Wachtel et al. (2002a) describe E. coli contamination of the roots of cabbage irrigated with sewage-contaminated stream water, although the edible part of the plant was unaffected. Islam et al. (2004) demonstrated that a single application of S. Typhimurium inoculated irrigation water resulted in contamination of carrot and radish at harvest, with Salmonella surviving for 203 days in soil postapplication. Lettuce plants irrigated with a single application of E. coli O157:H7 contaminated water tested positive for presence of E. coli O157:H7 at harvest (30 days postinoculation), and plants contaminated at days 7 and 14 of the study were shown to yield increased populations (Solomon *et al.* 2003). Quantitative risk assessment models for the use of reclaimed water show that risk varies between crops, with lettuce found to pose a higher risk than cucumber, but comparable to that of broccoli and cabbage (Hamilton *et al.* 2006). The interval between irrigation and harvest will affect the likelihood of pathogenic bacteria surviving to reach the consumer. A survey of UK-based salad vegetable producers showed that over 50% growers will harvest baby-leaf crops within 24 h of the last irrigation (Tyrell *et al.* 2006).

A number of outbreaks have been traced to the use of contaminated water in irrigation. Iceberg lettuce imported from Spain during 2005 caused cases of *S*. Typhimurium throughout the UK and Finland, after wastewater was used to irrigate the crop (Takkinen *et al.* 2005). Cases of *E. coli* O157:H7 in Sweden in 2005 were traced back to lettuce irrigated with water from a stream contaminated with cattle faeces (Söderström *et al.* 2005). Water may also act as a vehicle for the dissemination of viral particles. Beuchat (1996) reports a nontypical outbreak of norovirus linked to celery and irrigation with sewage-contaminated water has resulted in the outbreaks of hepatitis A linked to lettuce consumption (Seymour and Appleton 2001) and spring onions (Josefson 2003).

Hillborn *et al.* (1999) describe an outbreak of *E. coli* O157:H7 attributed to mesclun lettuce, assumed to be irrigated with water contaminated by cattle grazing a nearby field. Solomon *et al.* (2002) showed that *E. coli* O157:H7 in contaminated water can enter the vascular system of lettuce and reach the edible parts of the plant, although the authors point out that unrealistic inoculum concentrations were used.

Soil

Pathogens may be naturally present in soil, for example *Listeria* spp. (Nicholson *et al.* 2005), or may become incorporated in the soil matrix from organic wastes added as fertilizer. Pathogens within soil may contaminate crops directly when heavy rain or water gun irrigation causes leaf splash.

The ability of the pathogen to survive in the environment will impact on the likelihood of crop contamination and pathogen viability at harvest and through to consumption. Initially, the pathogen must survive in the propagation environment until crops are planted out, or in organic wastes applied to the land. Table 2 lists survival times for each enteropathogen from a number of studies.

Survival times are often inconsistent and reflect the variability in propagation environments and organic waste treatments. Kudva *et al.* (1998) demonstrated that aera-

Table 2	Survival	time of	enteropathogens	in th	e field	environi	ment
---------	----------	---------	-----------------	-------	---------	----------	------

Pathogen	Environment	Survival (day)	References		
Escherichia coli O157:H7	Soil + animal manure	30	Nicholson <i>et al.</i> (2005)		
E. coli O157:H7	Soil + animal manure	99	Nicholson <i>et al.</i> (2005)		
E. coli O157:H7	Animal manure	60	Avery et al. (2005)		
E. coli O157:H7	Slurries	60	Avery et al. (2005)		
E. coli O157:H7	Abattoir waste	60	Avery et al. (2005)		
E. coli O157:H7	Sewage sludge	60	Avery et al. (2005)		
E. coli O157:H7	Nonaerated ovine manure	>365	Kudva <i>et al.</i> (1998)		
E. coli O157:H7	Aerated ovine manure	120	Kudva <i>et al.</i> (1998)		
E. coli O157:H7	Nonaerated slurry	600	Kudva <i>et al.</i> (1998)		
E. coli O157:H7	Aerated slurry	30	Kudva <i>et al.</i> (1998)		
E. coli	Slurry + dirty water	90	Nicholson <i>et al.</i> (2005)		
Salmonella	Soil	968	Nicholson <i>et al.</i> (2005)		
Salmonella	Soil + bovine slurry	300	Nicholson <i>et al.</i> (2005)		
Salmonella	Soil + animal manure	30	Nicholson <i>et al.</i> (2005)		
Salmonella	Slurry + dirty water	90	Nicholson <i>et al.</i> (2005)		
Campylobacter	Soil + animal manure	30	Nicholson <i>et al.</i> (2005)		
Campylobacter	Slurry + dirty water	90	Nicholson <i>et al.</i> (2005)		
Listeria	Soil + animal manure	30	Nicholson <i>et al.</i> (2005)		
Listeria	Slurry + dirty water	180	Nicholson <i>et al.</i> (2005)		
L. monocytogenes	Soil + sewage sludge	56	Everis (2004)		
Hepatitis A	Water	>365	Seymour and Appleton (2001)		
Hepatitis A	Soil	96	Seymour and Appleton (2001)		

tion of ovine manure decreased survival of *E. coli* O157:H7 from >365 to 120 days. The application method used for organic wastes may increase survival time: clumping of material applied above ground, and injection application of liquid manures can protect bacteria from desiccation and high temperatures (Hutchison *et al.* 2004).

Stresses encountered during passage through the gut, for example the acidity of the environment, may increase survival by inducing entry to survival stages. Escherichia coli and Salmonella will exhibit the general stress response, producing a range of stress proteins which can confer cross-resistance to a range of stresses (Barker et al. 1999). Cross-protection mechanisms may extend bacterial survival in the environment, by reducing the impact of abiotic factors. Leyer and Johnson (1993) report that after acid adaptation, S. Typhimurium displayed increased tolerance of heat and osmotic stress, whilst Hartke et al. (1995) demonstrated that pre-irradiation of Lactococcus lactis increased resistance to lethal challenges of acid. The stress response of L. monocytogenes is similar to that of E. *coli*, but is regulated by the sigma factor $\sigma^{\rm B}$, which has been suggested to increase virulence (Wonderling et al. 2004). Campylobacter may enter a viable but nonculturable stage (Buswell et al. 1998), but the main mechanism of survival is production of large numbers of cells within the host (Jones 2001). Seasonal variation in shedding of pathogens can result in higher than expected microbial loads in faecal material: Campylobacter shedding increases in spring and autumn (Stanley and Jones 2003) and *E. coli* levels during spring and summer (Chapman *et al.* 1997). If increased pathogen loads are present, then simply following guidelines may not be sufficient for preventing crop contamination.

Survival in the phyllosphere

Interest is shifting towards the fitness of the enteropathogen on the leaf surface (phylloplane): if a pathogen can persist on the phylloplane, then the chance of an infectious dose remaining at consumption is increased. Beuchat (1999) showed that *E. coli* O157:H7 contained in bovine faeces and inoculated onto lettuce could be isolated from lettuce up to 15 days after inoculation. Fett (2000) suggested that transient occupants of the leaf, such as enteropathogens, may become incorporated into phylloplane biofilms.

Biofilms are complex structures composed of many species of bacteria, filamentous fungi and yeasts, with 10^6-10^8 cells fw⁻¹ g⁻¹ (Morris *et al.* 1998). Cells are enclosed within an exopolymeric matrix, which can buffer environmental changes such as nutrient stress and desiccation (Monier and Lindow 2005); therefore, bacteria within biofilms will have an increased survival rate. Between 30% and 80% of the total bacterial population on a leaf surface will be contained in these aggregates (Morris and Monier 2003), which tend to be associated with sources of nutrients such as leaf veins and glandular

trichomes (Monier and Lindow 2005). Fett (2000) showed that biofilms were present on the cotyledons, hypocotyls and roots of alfalfa, broccoli, sunflower and clover sprouts, by 2-day postgermination.

Enteropathogens can adapt to the phyllosphere environment, but may be outcompeted by epiphytic bacteria (Cooley et al. 2006), especially if both species compete for the same carbon source. Interactions between immigrant bacteria and epiphytes are diverse: Salmonella enterica has been demonstrated to aggregate with Pantoea agglomerans on the leaf surface of cilantro (Brandl and Mandrell 2002) and Wausteria paucula was shown to support actively the survival of E. coli O157:H7 in the rhizosphere and leaf-surface of lettuce (Cooley et al. 2006). Barak et al. (2002) demonstrated that S. Newport attached to alfalfa sprouts as efficiently as the plant-associated bacteria Pseudomonas putida, Pan. agglomerans and Rhanella aquatilis, and significantly better than E. coli O157:H7. However, epiphytes may also limit survival of immigrant bacteria; Cooley et al. (2006) demonstrated that S. Newport and E. coli O157:H7 could be out-competed on lettuce by Enterobacter asburiae, repressing growth of the enteropathogens 10-fold. Janiesiewicz et al. (1999b) reported that co-inoculation of E. coli O157:H7 and Pseudomonas syringiae into wound sites on apples suppressed the growth of E. coli and Carlin et al. (1996) demonstrated that the background flora present on endive prevented the growth of L. monocytogenes. These results suggest that there is potential for the naturally occurring microflora to be used as a biocontrol agent, to prevent enteropathogenic bacteria becoming established on the leaf.

Solomon and Matthews (2006) showed that bacterial processes, such as gene expression, motility or production of extracellular compounds, were not necessary for initial attachment but are likely to be important in further colonization and survival on the leaf. Plant-associated bacteria produce acyl-homoserine lactones (AHLs) for communication via quorum sensing, and Brandl (2006) hypothesizes that AHLs may help upregulate factors in enteropathogens beneficial to their survival on the leaf, such as expression of rpoS which increases resistance to stresses commonly encountered on the leaf, for example, desiccation.

A major factor in limiting bacterial survival in the phyllosphere is UV radiation. Ecologically successful phylloplane bacteria are efficient in UV-induced DNA damage repair or preferentially colonize sites that are protected from UV, such as within the interior of a leaf (phytopathogens) or at the base of structures such as trichomes (saprophytes) (Jacobs and Sundin 2001). The biofilm matrix also shields against the damaging effects of UV irradiation (Elasri and Miller 1999). Phyllosphere communities exhibit a marked shift towards UV tolerant phenotypes, for example, pigmented bacteria, as the growing season progresses (Jacobs and Sundin 2001). In *Pseudomonas syringae*, expression of the gene *rulAB* confers DNA repair capabilities and therefore increased UV tolerance (Sundin and Murillo 1999). *Escherichia coli* and *S. enterica* possess homologues of *rulAB* (Brandl 2006), suggesting an ability to withstand UV irradiation.

Enteropathogens encounter osmotic stress frequently when passing through the host gut, and consequently display a number of stress-avoidance mechanisms, mediated by *rpoS*, which may induce cross-resistance to stresses encountered on the leaf (Brandl 2006). For this to impact on survival, pathogens would have to become established on the leaf surface relatively and quickly after excretion from the host. Exposure to plant-produced antimicrobials upregulates a homologue of the sap operon in *Erwinia chrysanthemi*. In *S. enterica*, induction of the sap operon promotes acid-resistance and therefore survival in the acidic conditions of the gut; Brandl (2006) suggests that therefore a period of residence in the phyllosphere may lead to increased virulence of enteropathogens.

Further protection from environmental stresses may be afforded by movement into the internal tissue of the plant. This is normally a passive process, unlike the destructive entry of many phytopathogens: enteropathogens in irrigation water can be taken up by the root systems and enter the edible portion of the crop (Wachtel et al. 2002a), for example, lettuce (Seo and Frank 1999; Takeuchi and Frank 2000; Solomon et al. 2002), apple (Burnett et al. 2000) and tomato (Guo et al. 2001, 2002). Enteropathogens may also gain entry via wounds (Janisiewicz et al. 1999), or structures such as lenticels (Burnett et al. 2000) and stomata (Seo and Frank 1999). Infiltration of enteropathogenic bacteria through these structures can occur when bacteria are present in water on the surface of fruits (Burnett et al. 2000) and can be increased during processing if wash water is of a lower temperature than the fruit, creating a negative temperature differential (Buchanan et al. 1999).

The presence of phytopathogens may increase the penetration and growth of enteropathogenic bacteria, because of disruption of the cuticle and increased release of nutrients (Wells and Butterfield 1999). Richards and Beuchat (2005) report that co-inoculation of wound sites on cantaloupe with *S*. Poona and the phytopathogens *Cladosporium cladosporiodes* or *Penicillium expansum* increased penetration of *Salmonella* into the internal tissues of the fruit, because of the tissue breakdown caused by the fungi. Stopforth *et al.* (2004) demonstrated that *E. coli* O157:H7 can survive and proliferate in injured apple tissue, even after the use of sanitizers.

Oron et al. (1995) demonstrated that poliovirus applied to the roots of tomato plants can be recovered from the

leaves, but not the fruit. This was attributed to the presence of antiviral substances and not to an inability of the virus to reach the fruit. Dingman (2000) analysed the proliferation of E. coli O157:H7 in bruised apple tissue and observed that growth was suppressed in McIntosh apples, unlike the other cultivars used. This was thought to be due to production of an unstable or volatile inhibiting factor, as the effect was reduced during storage. Reinders et al. (2001) studied the effect of caffeic acid on E. coli O157:H7 survival in a model apple juice medium and demonstrated a reduction in E. coli populations, suggesting that phenolic acids play an important role in limiting the bacterial survival in planta. A range of phenolic acids, including caffeic acid, were shown to inhibit the survival of L. monocytogenes in vitro (Wen et al. 2003) and Delaquis et al. (2006) report evidence that an antilisterial factor, thought to be of a phenolic nature, is produced by wounding (shredding) of iceberg lettuce and therefore is likely to play a role in limiting L. monocytogenes growth in bagged salads.

The interaction between the host plant and epiphytes, symbionts and phytopathogens has been extensively studied. However, the role of plant-microbe interactions in limiting the colonization by enteropathogenic bacteria is not so well described. Production of antimicrobial factors may be a direct response to the presence of pathogenic bacteria. Dong et al. (2003) suggest that genetic aspects of both the host plant and Salmonella are involved in endophytic colonization. Barak et al. (2004) showed that virulence factors, including aggregative fimbriae and expression of rpoS, were involved in S. enterica attachment to alfalfa. Interestingly, these virulence genes are essential for infection in an animal host. There are a number of similarities between the systems employed by plant and animal pathogens. The type III secretion system (TTSS), which enables the delivery of pathogenicity proteins to the host cell, is conserved across the Gram-negative plant and animal pathogens, although the proteins secreted differ (Hueck 1998). Recognition of elements of the TTSS in phytopathogens causes induction of host plant defence mechanisms (Hueck 1998). The conserved nature of these factors in human pathogens suggests that plants may also respond to the presence of enteropathogenic bacteria in the phyllosphere. Iniguez et al. (2005) describe the role of host defences in limiting endophytic colonization by the enteric bacterium, S. Typhimurium. Addition of ethylene, the signal molecule which induces systemic resistance, decreased Salmonella colonization of the roots of the legume Medicago trunculata. Use of Salmonella mutants, deficient in structural components of the TTSS or flagella, showed increased colonization of the roots of alfalfa, and ethylene production was reduced, suggesting that the plant did not recognize the pathogen.

Further colonization studies using an *Arabidopsis thaliana* mutant (npr1) provided evidence that recognition of TTSS components induces salicylic acid-mediated defence signalling (Iniguez *et al.* 2005). The authors suggest that overexpression of defence-related genes in crop plants may present a novel method to control enteropathogen colonization in the field.

Conclusions

There is a dichotomy between POS survey data and outbreak instance. Overall, surveys suggest a low incidence of contamination. The regulations imposed on growers and the demand for comprehensive hazard analysis and critical control point (HACCP) strategies should prevent any environmental contamination reaching the consumer; however, these approaches do not fully prevent contamination remaining at POS. The fact that outbreaks linked to fruit and vegetable products can and do occur indicates that these outbreaks are the result of occasional contamination events, which are difficult to identify and control. At present, the food industry relies on postharvest interventions to limit the number of enteropathogens present on fresh produce at POS. The use of sanitizers, especially chlorine-based products, is an area of media interest and consumer concern, and chemicals cannot be used in organic production. Prevention of contamination therefore is a preferred strategy. To influence the survival of bacteria in the phyllosphere, we need to better understand the behaviour of bacteria on the leaf-surface, their interactions with other microbes and the host plant and the potential for internalization. Improved understanding of these areas will lead to new methods to limit enteropathogen survival on food crops. Potential areas of exploitation could include the addition of competitive microflora, the use of quorum-sensing molecule analogues to disrupt bacteria communication, or approaches aimed at preventing attachment, which could be targeted specifically at the molecular mechanisms involved. Further information on the factors which can limit survival in the field may lead to potential new intervention strategies to maximize the impact on bacterial communities, either on the plant itself or in water, soil and organic fertilizers prior to application, for example improved treatment methods or modified propogation environments.

Acknowledgements

The authors would like to acknowledge funding from the EU Framework 6 Programme 'Waterweb' and the Horticultural Development Council. Special thanks to Jason Wargent for helpful comments on the manuscript.

References

- Adak, G.K., Meakins, S.M., Yip, H., Lopman, B.A. and O'Brien, S.J. (2005) Disease risks from foods, England and Wales, 1996–2000. *Emerg Infect Dis* 11, 365–372.
- Al-Ghazali, M.R. and Al-Azawi, S.K. (1990) Listeria monocytogenes contamination of crops grown on soil treated with sewage sludge cake. J Appl Bacteriol 69, 642– 647.
- Anon (1993) United States Environmental Protection Agency Rule 503 in Biosolids Generation, Use, and Disposal in the United States. Washington, DC: US Environmental Protection Agency. http://www.epa.gov/epaoswer/non-hw/ compost/biosolid.pdf (accessed 22/04/07)
- Anon (1996) Ministry of the Environment Guidelines for the Utilization of Biosolids and Other Wastes on Agricultural Land, 1996. Toronto, ON: Ministry of the Environment, http://www.ene.gov.on.ca/envision/gp/3425e.pdf (accessed 22/04/07)
- Anon (2001a) Analysis and Evaluation of Preventive Control Measures for the Control and Reduction/Elimination of Microbial Hazards on Fresh and Fresh-Cut Produce, Chapter IV, Outbreaks Associated with Fresh Produce: Incidence, Growth, and Survival of Pathogens in Fresh and Fresh-Cut Produce. Rockville, MD: US Food and Drug Administration, http://www.cfsan.fda.gov/~comm/ift3-40.html (accessed 26/11/06)
- Anon (2001b) The Safe Sludge Matrix, 3rd edn. Wolverhampton, UK: ADAS. Downloadable from http://www.adas. co.uk/media_files/Publications/SSM.pdf, 18/01/07.
- Anon (2003) Water for People, Water for Life: Executive Summary. United Nations World Water Development Report 2003. Paris, France: UNESCO Publ., from http://unes doc.unesco.org/images/0012/001295/129556e.pdf viewed on 10/01/05.
- Anon (2005a), Health Protection Agency Advisory Committee on the Microbiological Safety of Food information paper 'Microbiological Status of RTE Fruit and Vegetables' ACM/745. London, UK: Food Standards Agency, from http://food. gov.uk/multimedia/pdfs/acm745amended.pdf (accessed on 11/10/06).
- Anon (2005b) *Update On Salmonella Outbreak*. Canada: Ministry of Health and Long-term Care, http://www.health. gov.on.ca/english/media/news_releases/archives/nr_05/ nr_121405.html (accessed on 22/04/07)
- Anon (2007) Consumer Attitudes to Food Standards Report, Wave 7. London, UK: Food Standards Agency. http:// www.food.gov.uk/multimedia/pdfs/cas07uk.pdf (accessed on 24/04/07)
- Arumugaswamy, R.K., Ali, G.R.R. and Hamid, S.N.B.A. (1994) Prevalence of *Listeria monocytogenes* in foods in Malaysia, Int. *Journal Food Microbiol* 23, 117–121.
- Avery, L.M., Killham, K. and Jones, D.L. (2005) Survival of *E. coli* O157: H7 in organic wastes destined for land application. *J Appl Microbiol* 98, 814–822.

- Barak, J.D., Gorski, L., Naraghi-Arani, P., Charkowsk, A.O. (2004) Salmonella enterica virulence genes are required for bacterial attachment to plant tissue. Appl Environ Microbiol 71, 5685–5691.
- Barak, J.D., Whitehand, L.C. and Charkowski, A.O. (2002) Differences in attachment of *Salmonella enterica* serovars and *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 to alfalfa sprouts. *Appl Envi*ron Microbiol 68, 4758–4763.
- Barker, J., Humphrey, T.J. and Brown, M.W.R. (1999) Survival of *Escherichia coli* O157 in a soil protozon: implications for disease. *FEMS Microbiol Lett* **173**, 291–295.
- Beuchat, L.R. (1996) Pathogenic microorganisms associated with fresh produce. *J Food Prot* **59**, 204–216.
- Beuchat, L.R. (1998). Surface Decontamination of Fruits and Vegetables Eaten Raw: A Review. Geneva, Switzerland: World Health Organisation, Food Safety Unit. WHO/FSF/FOS/98.2.
- Beuchat, L.R. (1999) Survival of enterohaemorrhagic Escherichia coli O157:H7 in bovine faeces applied to lettuce and the effectiveness of chlorinated water as a disinfectant. J Food Prot 62, 845–849.
- Beuchat, L.R. and Brackett, R.E. (1990) Survival and growth of *Listeria monocytogenes* on lettuce as influenced by shredding, chlorine treatment, modified atmosphere packaging and temperature. *J Food Sci* 55, 755–758.
- Bidawid, S., Farber, J.M. and Sattar, S.A. (2001) Survival of hepatitis A virus on modified atmosphere-packaged (MAP) lettuce. *Food Microbiol* 18, 95–102.
- Blakeman, J.P. (1985) Ecological succession of leaf surface microorganisms. In Relation to Biological Control ed.
 Windels, C.E. and Lindow, S.E. pp. 6–30. Minnesota: Biological Control on the Phylloplane, American Phytopathological Society.
- Brandl, M.T. (2006) Fitness of enteropathogens on plants and implications for food safety. *Ann Rev Phytopath* **44**, 367– 392.
- Brandl, M.T. and Mandrell, R.E. (2002) Fitness of *Salmonella enterica* serovar Thompson in the cilantro phyllosphere. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **68**, 3614–3621.
- Brandl, M.T., Haxo, A.F., Bates, A.H. and Mandrell, R.E. (2004) Comparison of survival of *Campylobacter jejuni* in the phyllosphere with that in the rhizosphere of spinach and radish plants. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **70**, 1182–1189.
- Buchanan, R.L., Edelson, E.G., Miller, R.L. and Sapers, G.M. (1999) Contamination of intact apples after immersion in an aqueous environment containing *Escherichia coli* O157:H7. *J Food Prot* 62, 444–450.
- Burnett, S.L., Chen, J. and Beuchat, L.R. (2000) Attachment of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 to the surfaces and internal structures of apples as detected by confocal scanning laser microscopy. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 66, 4679–4687.
- Buswell, C.M., Herlihy, Y.M., Lawrence, L.M., McGuiggan,
 J.T.M., Marsh, P.D., Keevil, C.W. and Leach, S.A. (1998)
 Extended survival and persistence of *Campylobacter* spp. in water and aquatic biofilms and their detection by immu-

nofluorescent-antibody and-rRNA staining. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **64**, 733–741.

- Callister, S.M. and Aggar, W.A. (1987) Enumeration and chracterisation of *A. hydrophila* and *A. caviae* isolated from grocery store produce. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **53**, 249–253.
- Campbell, J.V, Mohle-Boetani, J., Reporter, R., Abbott, S., Farrar, J., Brandl, M., Mandrell, M.R. and Werner, S.B. (2001) An outbreak of *Salmonella* serotype Thompson associated with fresh cilantro. *J Infect Dis* 183, 984–987.
- Carlin, F., Nguyen-The, C., DaSilva, A.A. and Cochet, C. (1996) Effects of carbon dioxide on the fate of *Listeria monocytogenes*, of aerobic bacteria and on the development of spoilage in minimally processed fresh endive. *Food Microbiol* 32, 159–172.
- CDC (1998) Outbreak of *Campylobacter* Enteritis associated with cross-contamination of food – Oklahoma, 1996. *Morb Mortal Wkly Rep* **47**, 129–131.
- CDC (2002a) Multistate outbreaks of *Salmonella* Serotype Poona infections associated with eating cantaloupe from Mexico – United States and Canada, 2000–2002. *Morb Mortal Wkly Rep* **51**, 1044–1047.
- CDC (2002b) Outbreak of Salmonella serotype Kottbus infections associated with eating alfalfa sprouts – Arizona, California, Colorado, and New Mexico, February–April 2001. Morb Mortal Wkly Rep 51, 7–9.
- CDC (2002c) Outbreak of Salmonella serotype Javiana infections – Orlando, Florida, June 2002. Morb Mortal Wkly Rep 51, 683–684.
- CDC (2004) Outbreak of *Salmonella* serotype Enteritidis infections associated with raw almonds – United States and Canada, 2003–2004. *Morb Mortal Wkly Rep* **53**, 484–487.
- CDC (2005) Outbreaks of *Salmonella* infections associated with eating roma tomatoes – United States and Canada, 2004. *Morb Mortal Wkly Rep* **54**, 325–328.
- CDC (2006a) http://www.cdc.gov/ncidod/dbmd/diseaseinfo/ salmonellosis_2006/ outbreak_notice.htm (accessed on 11/01/07).
- CDC (2006b) Ongoing multistate outbreak of *Escherichia coli* serotype O157:H7 infections associated with consumption of fresh spinach – United States, September 2006. *Morb Mortal Wkly Rep* **55**, 1045–1046.
- CDC (2006c) Atlanta, GA: Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. http://www.cdc.gov/ecoli/2006/december/ 121406.htm (accessed on 11/01/07)
- CDC (2007) Preliminary Foodnet Data on the Incidence of Pathogens Transmitted Commonly Through Food, 10 States, 2006. Atlanta, GA: Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. http://www.cdc.gov/mmwr/preview/mmwrhtml/ mm5614a4.htm?s_cid=mm5614a4_e (accessed on 22/04/07)
- Chapman, P.A., Siddons, C.A., Cerdan Malo, A.T. and Harkin, M.A. (1997) A 1-year study of *E. coli* O157:H7 in cattle, sheep, pigs and poultry. *Epidemiol Infect* **119**, 254–250.

- Cooley, M.B., Chao, D. and Mandrell, R.E. (2006) *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 survival and growth on lettuce is altered by the presence of epiphytic bacteria. *J Food Prot* **69**, 2329–2335.
- Cotterelle, B., Drougard, C., Rolland, C., Becamel, M., Boudon, M., Pinede, S., Traoré, O., Balay, K. *et al.* (2005) Outbreak of Norovirus infection associated with the consumption of frozen raspberries, France, March 2005. *Eurosurveillance Weekly* **10**, E050428.1. http://www.eurosurveillance.org/ew/2005/050428.asp (accessed on 22/04/07)
- Crépet, A., Albert, I., Dervin, C. and Carlin, F. (2007) Estimation of microbial contamination of food from prevalence and concentration data: application to *Listeria monocytogenes* in fresh vegetables. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **73**, 250– 258.
- DEFRA (1998) Codes of Good Agricultural Practice. London, UK: Defra Publ. Downloadable from http://www. defra.gov.uk/farm/environment/cogap/index.htm (accessed on 19/01/07).
- Delaquis, P.J., Wen, A., Toivonen, P.M.A. and Stanich, K. (2006) Evidence of an antilisterial factor induced by wounding of iceberg lettuce tissues. *Lett Appl Microbiol* 42, 289–295.
- Dingman, D.W. (2000) Growth of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 in bruised apple (*Malus domestica*) tissue as influenced by cultivar, date of harvest and source. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **66**, 1077–1083.
- Dong, Y., Iniguez, A.L., Ahmer, B.M.M. and Triplett, E.W. (2003) Kinetics and strain specificity of rhizosphere and endophytic colonisation by enteric bacteria on seedlings of *Medicago sativa* and *M. truncatula. Appl Environ Microbiol* 69, 1783–1790.
- Doran, G., Sheridan, F., DeLappe, N., O'Hare, C., Anderson, W., Corbett-Feeney, G. and Cormican, M. (2005) Salmonella enterica serovar Kedougou contamination of commercially grown mushrooms. Diagn Microbiol Infect Dis 51, 73–76.
- Duffell, E., Espie, E., Nichols, T., Adak, G.K., De Valk, H., Anderson, K. and Stuart, J.M. (2003) Investigation of An Outbreak of *E. coli* O157 Infections Associated with A Trip to France of Schoolchildren from Somerset, England. *Eurosurveillance Weekly* 8, 81–86 (http://www.eurosurveillance. org/em/v08n04/0804-221.asp).
- Elasri, M.O. and Miller, R.V. (1999) Study of the response of a biofilm bacterial community to UV radiation. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **65**, 2025–2031.
- Evans, M.R., Ribeiro, C.D. and Salmon, R.L. (2003) Hazards of healthy living: bottled water and salad vegetables as risk factors for *Campylobacter* infection. *Emerg Infect Dis* **9**, 1219–1225.
- Everis, L. (2004) *Risks of Pathogens in Ready-to-eat Fruits, Vegetables, and Salads Through the Production Process.* Chipping Campden, UK: Review no. 44, Campden and Chorleywood Food Research Association Group.

Farber, J.M., Wang, S.L., Cai, Y. and Zhang, S. (1998) Changes in populations of *Listeria monocytogenes* inoculated onto packaged fresh cut vegetables. *J Food Prot* 61, 192–195.

Fett, W.F. (2000) Naturally occurring biofilms on alfalfa and other types of sprouts. *J Food Prot* **63**, 625–632.

Francis, G.A., Thomas, C. and O'Beirne, D. (1999) The microbiological safety safety of minimally processed vegetables. *Int J Food Sci Tech* 34, 1–22.

Gillespie, I.A. (2004) Outbreak of Salmonella Newport infection associated with lettuce in the UK. Eurosurveillance Weekly 8, http://www.eurosurveillance.org/ew/2004/ 041007.asp.

Gillespie, I.A., O'Brien, S.J., Adak, G.K., Tam, C.C., Frost, J.A. and Bolton, F.J. (2003) Point source outbreaks of *Campylobacter jejuni* infection – are they more common than we think and what might cause them? *Epidemiol Infect* **130**, 367–375.

Guo, X., Chen, J., Brackett, R.E. and Beuchat, L.R. (2001) Survival of Salmonellae on and in tomato plants from the time of inoculation at flowering and early stages of fruit development through fruit ripening. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 67, 4760–4764.

Guo, X., van Iersel, M.W., Chen, J., Brackett, R.E and Beuchat, L.R. (2002) Evidence of association of Salmonellae with tomato plants grown hydroponically in inoculated nutrient solution. *App Environ Microbiol* 68, 3639–3643.

Hamilton, A.J., Stagnitti, F., Premier, R., Boland, A-M. and Hale, G. (2006) Quantitative microbial risk assessment models for consumption of raw vegetables irrigated with reclaimed water. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 72, 3284–3290.

Harb, J., Isaacs, S., Fyfe, M., Crowe, L., Slater, B., Ahmed, R., Rodgers, F., Anderson, C. *et al.* (2003) .Outbreak of *Salmonella* Enteritidis phage type 11b in the provinces of Alberta and Saskatchewan, June 2000. *Can Commun Dis Rep* 29, 125–128.http://www.phac-aspc.gc.ca/publicat/ ccdr-rmtc/03vol29/dr2914eb.html (accessed on 22/04/07)

Harriman, S.A. (1998) Outbreak of Campylobacter, Connecticut, 1997, Conneticut Epidemiologist, 18, Hartford, CT: State of Connecticut Dept. Public Health http://www.dph.state. ct.us/Publications/BCH/Infectious%20Diseases/vol18n2.pdf (accessed on 16/01/07).

Hartke, A., Bouche, S., Laplace, J.M., Benachour, A., Boutibonnes, P. and Auffray, Y. (1995) UV-inducible proteins and UV-induced cross-protection against acid, ethanol, H₂O₂ or heat-treatments in *Lactococcus-lactis* subsp *lactis. Arch Microbiol* 163, 329–336.

Harvey, J. and Gilmour, A. (1993) Occurrence and characteristics of *Listeria* in food produced in Northern Ireland. *Int J Food Microbiol* **19**, 193–205.

Heisick, J.E., Wagner, D.E., Nierman, M.L. and Peeler, J.T. (1989) Listeria spp. found on fresh market produce. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 55, 1925–1927.

Herwaldt, B.L., Lew, J.F., Moe, C.L., Lewis, D.C., Humphrey, C.D., Monroe, S.S., Pon, E.W. and Glass, R.I. (1994) Characterization of a variant strain of norwalk virus from a food-borne outbreak of gastroenteritis on a cruise ship in Hawaii. *J Clin Micrbiol* **32**, 861–866.

- Hilborn, E.D., Mermin, J.H., Mshar, P.A., Hadler, J.L.,
 Voetsch, A., Wojtkunski, C., Swartz, M., Mshar, R., *et al.* (1999) A multistate outbreak of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 infections associated with consumption of mesclun lettuce. *Arch Intern Med* 159, 1758–1764.
- Hjertqvist, M., Johansson, A., Svensson, N., Åbom, P.E., Magnusson, C., Olsson, M., Hedlund, K.O. and Andersson, Y. (2006) Four outbreaks of Norovirus gastroenteritis after consuming raspberries, Sweden, June–August 2006. *Eurosurveillance Weekly* 11, E060907.1. http://www.eurosurveillance.org/ew/2006/060907.asp (accessed on 22/04/07)

Honish, L. and Nguyen, Q. (2001). Outbreak of Salmonella Enteritidis phage type 913 gastroenteritis associated with mung bean sprouts – Edmonton, 2001. Can Commun Dis Rep. 27, 151–156.. http://www.phac-aspc.gc.ca/ publicat/ccdr-rmtc/01vol27/dr2718eb.html (accessed on 22/04/07)

- Horby, P.W., O'Brien, S.J., Adak, G.K., Graham, C., Hawker, J.I., Hunter, P., Lane, C., Lawson, A.J. et al. (2003) A national outbreak of multi-resistant Salmonella enterica serovar Typhimurium definitive phage type (DT) 104 associated with consumption of lettuce. Epidemiol Infect 130, 169–178.
- Hueck, C.L. (1998) Type III secretion systems in bacterial pathogens of animals and plants. *Microbiol Rev* **62**, 379–433.
- Hutchison, M.L., Walters, L.D., Moore, A., Crookes, K.M. and Avery, S.M. (2004) Effect of length of time before incorporation on survival of pathogenic bacteria present in livestock wastes applied to agricultural soil. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **70**, 5111–5118.
- Iniguez, A.L., Donh, Y., Carter, H.D., Ahmer, B.M.M., Stone, J.M. and Triplett, E.W. (2005) Regulation of enteric endophytic bacterial colonisation by plant defences. *MPMI* 18, 169–178.

Islam, M., Morgan, J., Doyle, M.P., Phatak, S.C., Millner, P. and Jiang, X. (2004) Fate of *Salmonella enterica* serovars Typhimurium on carrots and radishes grown in fields treated with contaminated manure composts or irrigation water. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **70**, 2497–2502.

Isonhood, J.H. and Drake, M. (2002) *Aeromonas* species in food. *J Food Prot* **65**, 575–582.

Jacobs, J.L. and Sundin, G.W. (2001) Effect of solar UV-B radiation on a phyllosphere bacterial community. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **67**, 5488–5496.

Jacxens, L., Devlieghere, F., Falcato, P. and Debevere, J. (1999) Behaviour of *L. monocytogenes* and *Aeromonas* spp. on fresh cut produce packaged under equilibrium modified atmosphere. *J Food Prot* **62**, 1128–1135.

Janisiewicz, W.J., Conway, W.S., Brown, M.W., Sapers, G.M., Fratamico, P. and Buchanan, R.L. (1999a) Fate of *Escheri*- *chia coli* O157:H7 on fresh-cut apple tissue and its potential for transmission by fruit flies. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **65**, 1–5.

Johnston, L.M., Jaykus, L-A., Moll, D., Anciso, J., Mora, B. and Moe, C.L. (2006) A field study of the microbiological quality of fresh produce of domestic and Mexican origin. *Int J Food Microbiol* **112**, 83–95.

Jones, K. (2001) Campylobacters in water, sewage and the environment. *J Appl Microbiol* **90**, 688–79S.

Josefson, D. (2003) Three die in US outbreak of hepatitis. BMJ 327, 7425.1188.

Kirk, M., Waddell, R., Dalton, C., Creaser, A. and Rose, N. (1997) A prolonged outbreak of *Campylobacter* infection at a training facility. *Commun Dis Intell* 21, 57–61.

Korsager, B., Hede, B., Bøggild, H., Böttiger, B. and Mølbak, K. (2005). Two outbreaks of Norovirus infections associated with the consumption of imported frozen raspberries, Denmark, May–June 2005. *Eurosurveillance Weekly* 10, E050623.1. http://www.eurosurveillance.org/ew/ 2005/050623.asp (accessed on 24/04/07)

Kudva, I.T., Blanch, K. and Hovde, C.J. (1998) Analysis of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 survival in ovine or bovine manure and manure slurry. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 64, 3166–3174.

Kumar, A., Agarwal, R.K., Bhilegaonkar, K.N., Shome, B.R. and Bachhil, V.N. (2001) Occurrence of *Campylobacter jejuni* in vegetables. *Int J Food Microbiol* 67, 153–155.

Le Guyader, F.S., Mittelholzer, C., Haugarreau, L., Hedlund, K.-O., Alsterlund, R., Pommepuy, M. and Svensson, L. (2004) Detection of noroviruses in raspberries associated with a gastroenteritis outbreak. *Int J Food Microbiol* **9**, 179–186.

Leyer, G.J. and Johnson, E.A. (1993) Acid adaptation induces cross-protection against environmental stresses in Salmonella Typhimurium. Appl Environ Microbiol 59, 1842– 1847.

Lin, C-M., Fernando, S.Y. and Wei, C. (1996) Occurrence of Listeria monocytogenes, Salmonella spp., Escherichia coli and E. coli O157 in vegetables salads. Food Control 7, 135–140.

Mandrell, R.E. and Brandl, M.T. (2004) In Campylobacter species and fresh produce: outbreaks, Incidence and Biology.
In *Preharvest and Postharvest Food Safety, Contemporary Issues and Future Directions* ed. Beier, R.C., Pillai, S.D., Phillips, T.D. and Ziprin, R.L. pp. 59–72 Oxford, UK: Blackwell Publishing.

McLauchlin, J., Mitchell, R.T., Smerdon, W.J. and Jewell, K. (2004) *Listeria monocytogenes* and listeriosis: a review of hazard characterisation for use in microbiological risk assessment of foods. *Int Journal Food Microbiol* **92**, 15–33.

McMahon, M.A.S. and Wilson, I.G. (2001) The occurrence of enteric pathogens and *Aeromonas* species in organic vege-tables. *Int J Food Microbiol* **70**, 155–162.

Merino, S., Rubires, X., Knochel, S. and Tomas, J.M. (1995) Emerging pathogens: *Aeromonas* spp. Int J Food Microbiol 28, 157–168. Moller Nielsen, E., Skov, M.N., Madsen, J.J., Lodal, J., Brochner Jespersen, J. and Baggesen, D.L. (2004) Verocytotoxin-producing *Escherichia coli* in wild birds and rodents in close proximity to farms. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **70**, 6944–6947.

Monier, J.M. and Lindow, S.E. (2005) Aggregates of resident bacteria facilitate survival of immigrant bacteria on leaf surfaces. *Microbiol Ecol* **49**, 343–352.

Morris, C.E. and Monier, J.M. (2003) The ecological significance of biofilm formation by plant-associated bacteria. *Ann Rev Phytopath* **41**, 429–453.

Morris, C.E., Monier, J-M. and Jacques, M-A. (1998) A technique to quantify the population size and composition of the biofilm component in communities of bacteria in the phyllosphere. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **64**, 4789–4795.

Natvig, E.E., Ingham, S.C., Ingham, B.H., Cooperband, L.R. and Roper, T.R. (2002) Salmonella enterica serovar Typhimurium and Escherichia coli contamination of root and leaf vegetables grown in soils with incorporated bovine manure. Appl Environ Microbiol 68, 2737–2744.

Neyts, K., Huys, G., Uyttendaele, M., Swings, J. and Debevere, J. (2001) Incidence and identification of mesophilic *Aeromonas* spp. from retail foods. *Lett Appl Microbiol* **31**, 359– 363.

Nicholson, F.A., Groves, S.J. and Chambers, B.J. (2005) Pathogen survival during livestock manure storage and following land application. *Biores Tech* **96**, 135–143.

Nygard, K., Lassen, J., Vold, L. and Aavitsland, P. (2004) Outbreak of *Salmonella* Thompson infections caused by contaminated ruccola (rocket) salad – update. *Eurosurveillance Weekly* **8**, http://www.eurosurveillance.org/ew/2004/ 041216.asp.

Obiri-Danso, K., Paul, N.D. and Jones, K. (2001) The effects of UVB and temperature on the survival of natural populations and pure cultures of *Campylobacter jejuni, Camp. coli, Camp. lari* and urease-positive thermophilic campylobacters (UPTC) in surface waters. *J Appl Microbiol* **90**, 256–267.

Odumeru, J.A., Mitchell, S.J., Alves, D.M., *et al.* (1997) Assessment of the microbiological quality of ready-to-use vegetables for healthcare food services. *J Food Prot* **60**, 954–960.

Oron, G., Goemans, M., Manor, Y. and Feyen, J. (1995) Poliovirus distribution in the soil-plant system under reuse of secondary wastewater. *Wat Res* **29**, 1069–1078.

Park, C.E. and Sanders, G.W. (1992) Occurrence of thermotolerant Campylobacters in fresh vegetables sold at farmer's outdoor markets and supermarkets. *Can J Microbiol* 38, 313–316.

Pezzoli, L., Elson, R., Little, C., Fisher, I., Yip, H., Peters, T., Hampton, M., De Pinna, E. *et al.* (2007) International outbreak of *Salmonella* Senftenberg in 2007. *Eurosurveillance Weekly* 12, http://www.eurosurveillance.org/ew/2007/ 070614.asp (accessed on 15/06/07)

Reinders, R.D., Biesterveld, S. and Bijker, P.G.H (2001) Survival of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 ATCC 43895 in a model apple

juice medium with different concentrations of proline and caffeic acid. *Appl Environ Microbiol* **67**, 2863–2866.

- Richards, G.M. and Beuchat, L.R. (2005) Infection of cantaloupe rind with *Cladosporium cladosporioides* and *Penicillum expansum* and associated migration of *Salmonella Poona* into edible tissues. *Int Journal Food Microbiol* 103, 1–10.
- Saad, S.M.I., Iaria, T. and Furnaletto, S.M.P. (1995) Motile Aeromonas species in retail vegetables from San Paulo, Brazil. Rev Microbiol 26, 22–27.
- Schlech, W.F., Lavigne, P.M., Bortolussi, R.A., Allen, A.C., Haldane, E.V., Wort, A.J., Hightower, A.W., Johnson, S.E., *et al.* (1983) Epidemic listeriosis: evidence for transmission by food. *N Engl J Med* **308**, 203–206.
- Seo, K.H. and Frank, J.F. (1999) Attachment of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 to lettuce leaf surfaces and bacterial viability in response to chlorine treatment as demonstrated by using confocal scanning laser microscopy. *J Food Prot* 62, 3–9.
- Seymour, I.J. and Appleton, H. (2001) A review, foodborne viruses and fresh produce. J Appl Microbiol **91**, 759–773.
- Sivaplasingham, S., Friedman, C.R., Cohen, L. and Tauxe, R.V. (2004) Fresh produce: a growing cause of outbreaks of foodborne illness in the United States, 1973 through 1997. *J Food Prot* 67, 2342–2353.
- Söderström, A., Lindberg, A. and Andersson, Y. (2005) EHEC O157 outbreak in Sweden from locally produced lettuce, August–September 2005. *Eurosurveillance Weekly* 10, E050922.1. (http://www.eurosurveillance.org/ew/2005/ 050922.asp#1).
- Solomon, E.B. and Matthews, K.R. (2006) Interaction of live and dead *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 and fluorescent microspheres with lettuce tissue suggests bacterial processes do not mediate adherence. *Lett Appl Microbiol* **42**, 88–93.
- Solomon, E.B., Yaron, S. and Matthews, K.R. (2002) Transmission of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 from contaminated manure and irrigation water to lettuce plant tissue and its subsequent internalisation. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 68, 397–400.
- Solomon, E.B., Pang, H-J and Matthews, K.R. (2003) Persistence of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 on lettuce plants following spray irrigation with contaminated water. *J Food Prot* 66, 2198–2202.
- Stanley, K. and Jones, K. (2003) Cattle and sheep farms as a reservoir of *Campylobacter*. J Appl Microbiol **94**, 104s–113s.
- Steele, M. and Odemeru, J. (2004) Irrigation water as a source of foodborne pathogens on fruit and vegetables. J Food Prot 67, 2839–2849.
- Stopforth, J.D., Ikeda, J.S., Kendall, P.A. and Stofos, J.N. (2004) Survival of acid-adapted or nonadapted *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 in apple wounds and surrounding tissue following chemical treatments and storage. *Int J Food Microbiol* **90**, 51–61.
- Stratton, J., Stefaniw, L., Grimsrud, K., Werker, D.H., Ellis, A., Ashton, E., Chui, L., Blewett, E. *et al.* (2001) Outbreak of *Salmonella* Paratyphi B var. java due to contaminated

alfalfa sprouts in Alberta, British Columbia and Saskatchewan. *Can Commun Dis Rep* **27**, 133–137; discussion 137– 138. http://www.phac-aspc.gc.ca/publicat/ccdr-rmtc/ 01vol27/dr2716ea.html (accessed on 22/04/07)

- Sundin, G.W. and Murillo, J. (1999) Functional analysis of the *Pseudomonas syringae* rulAB determinant in tolerance to ultraviolet B (290-320 nm) radiation and distribution of rulAB among *P-syringae* pathovars. *Env Microbiol* 1, 75– 87.
- Szabo, E.A., Scurrah, K.J. and Burrows, J.M. (2000) Survey for psychrotrophic bacterial pathogens in minimally processed lettuce. *Lett Appl Microbiol* **30**, 456–460.
- Takeuchi, K. and Frank, J.F. (2000) Penetration of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 into lettuce tissues as affected by inoculum size and temperature and the effect of chlorine treatment on cell viability. *J Food Prot* **63**, 434–440.
- Takkinen, J., Nakari, U-M., Johansson, T., Niskanen, T., Siitonen, A. and Kuusi, M. (2005) A nationwide outbreak of multiresistant *Salmonella* Typhimurium var. Copenhagen DT104B infection in Finland due to contaminated lettuce from Spain, May 2005. *Eurosurveillance Weekly* 10, http:// www.eurosurveillance.org/ew/2005/050630.asp (accessed on 16/01/07).
- Taormina, P.J., Beuchat, L.R. and Slutsker, L. (1999) Infections associated with eating seed sprouts: an international concern. *Emerg Infect Dis* 5, 626–633.
- Thunberg, R.L., Tran, T.T., Bennett, R.W. and Matthews, R.N. (2002) Research Note: microbial evaluation of selected fresh produce obtained at retail markets. *J Food Prot* **65**, 677–682.
- Tyrell, S.F., Knox, J.W. and Weatherhead, E.K. (2006) Microbiological water quality requirements for salad irrigation in the United Kingdom. *J Food Prot* **69**, 2029–2035.
- Velazquez, L.C., Scudero, M.E., Digenaro, M.S., Decortinez, Y.M. and Guzman, M.S. (1998) Survival of Aeromonas hydrophila in fresh tomatoes stored at different temperatures and treated with chlorine. J Food Prot 61, 414–418.
- Wachtel, M.R., Whitehand, L.C. and Mandrell, R.E. (2002a) Association of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 with preharvest leaf lettuce upon exposure to contaminated irrigation water. J Food Prot 65, 18–25.
- Wallace, J.S., Cheasty, T. and Jones, K. (1997) Isolation of verocytotoxigenic producing *Escherichia coli* O157 from wild birds. *J Appl Microbiol* 82, 399–404.
- Wells, J.M and Butterfield, J.E. (1999) Incidence of *Salmonella* on fresh fruits and vegetables affected by fungal rots or physical injury. *Plant Dis* **83**, 722–726.
- Wen, A., Delaquis, P., Stanich, K. and Toinoven, P (2003) Antilisterial activity of selected phenolic acids. *Food Microbiol* 20, 305–311.
- Wonderling, L.D., Wilkinson, B.J. and Bayles, D.O. (2004) The htrA (degP) gene of Listeria monocytogenes 10403S is essential for optimal growth under stress conditions. Appl Environ Microbiol 70, 1935–1943.